

Message Text

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 01 STATE 141569
ORIGIN IO-14

INFO OCT-01 ISO-00 /015 R

66011
DRAFTED BY IO/SCT:JPTREVITHICK
APPROVED BY IO/SCT:JPTREVITHICK
-----181425Z 000086 /43
R 172200Z JUN 77
FM SECSTATE WASHDC
TO AMEMBASSY CAIRO
AMEMBASSY DAKAR

C O N F I D E N T I A L STATE 141569

OL REPEAT VIENNA 4911 ACTION SECSTATE INFO USERDA WASHDC
ERDA GERMANTOWN CAPETOWN USUN DTD 17 JUN.

QUOTE

C O N F I D E N T I A L VIENNA 4911

USIAEA

DEPARTMENT PASS IO/SCT CAPE TOWN FOR EMBASSY

E.O. 11652: GDS
TAGS: AORG, PARM, IAEA, SF
SUBJECT: JUNE BOARD MEETING: AGENDA ITEM 7: DESIGNATION OF MEMBERS

REF: A) STATE 138395, B) VIENNA 4789 (NOTAL) IAEA
C) STATE 134273 (NOTAL)

SUMMARY: AFTER TWENTY YEARS OF BOARD MEMBERSHIP AS ONE
OF THE MOST ADVANCED MEMBER STATES IN NUCLEAR TECHNOLOGY,
SOUTH AFRICA LOST ITS DESIGNATED BOARD SEAT TO EGYPT AS
A RESULT OF TWO ROLL-CALL VOTES ON QUESTION OF WHETHER
CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 02 STATE 141569

EGYPT OR SOUTH AFRICA SHOULD REPRESENT REGION OF AFRICA.
END OF SUMMARY.

1. VOTES WHICH RESULTED IN SOUTH AFRICA'S EXCLUSION FROM 1977-78
BOARD CULMINATED TWO AND A HALF HOURS OF TENDENTIOUS
AND HIGHLY POLARIZED DISCUSSION IN WHICH SOME THIRTY OUT
OF THIRTY-FOUR BOARD MEMBERS PARTICIPATED. FIRST VOTE,

CALLED FOR BY SOUTH AFRICAN GOVERNOR, WAS ON AMENDMENT PROPOSED BY HIM WHICH WOULD SUBSTITUTE SOUTH AFRICA AS DESIGNEE FOR AF, FOR EGYPT WHICH CHAIRMAN HAD INCLUDED IN HIS LIST OF DESIGNEES. ROLL CALL VOTE ON HIS PROPOSED AMENDMENT WAS: IN FAVOR - 13(U.S.), OPPOSED - 19, ONE ABSTENTION (CHILE), ONE NOT ENTITLED TO VOTE FOR NON-PAYMENT OF ITS ASSESSMENT (COLUMBIA). SECOND VOTE, TAKEN AT INSISTANCE OF NIGERIAN GOVERNOR, WAS AN ACCEPTANCE OF CHAIRMAN'S LIST (NAMING EGYPT) AND, EXCEPT FOR ABSTENTION ON PART OF JAPANESE DELEGATE HAD SAME RESULT: IN FAVOR - 19, OPPOSED - 12(U.S.), ABSTENTION - 2.

2. DISCUSSION ON THIS ITEM WAS DELAYED UNTIL LATE AFTERNOON OF JUNE 16 AT CHAIRMAN'S SUGGESTION TO ALLOW MORE TIME FOR COMPROMISE SETTLEMENT TO BE REACHED. FACED WITH SITUATION IN WHICH, FAR FROM CONSENSUS BEING ACHIEVED, POSITIONS WERE OBVIOUSLY POLARIZING FURTHER, BOARD CHAIRMAN CISSE OPTED FOR COURSE DESCRIBED PARA 2(A) REF B, STATING TO BOARD THAT WHILE HIS CONSULTATIONS HAD DISCLOSED A NUMBER OF RESERVATIONS AS TO WHICH STATE SHOULD BE DESIGNATED FOR THE REGION OF AFRICA, HE NONETHELESS BELIEVED THAT A MAJORITY OF BOARD MEMBERS WOULD WISH TO DESIGNATE A LIST INCLUDING THE NAMES OF THOSE PRESENTLY DESIGNATED, (WHICH HE THEN READ OFF) EXCEPT THAT EGYPT SHOULD REPLACE SOUTH AFRICA.

3. SOUTH AFRICAN GOVERNOR (VON SCHIRNDING) INTERVENED WITH BITTER AND STRONGLY-WORDED PREPARED STATEMENT (TEXT TRANSMITTED VIA AIRGRAM) PROTESTING CHAIRMAN'S INCLUSION OF EGYPT AS FLAGRANT VIOLATION OF STATUTE. ALL GOVERNORS,
CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 03 STATE 141569

HE SAID, WERE AWARE THAT HIS COUNTRY WAS THE ONLY ONE IN REGION ENTITLED TO DESIGNATION BY TERMS OF ARTICLE VI OF STATUTE AND HAD BEEN SO DESIGNATED FOR LAST TWENTY YEARS. ATTEMPT TO REMOVE SOUTH AFRICA WAS QUOTE RUTHLESS POLITICLA VENDETTA UNQUOTE. LED BY GROUP OF STATES THEMSELVES GUILTY OF FORMS OF OPPRESSION AND HAVING LITTLE REGARD FOR STATUTE OF AGENCY. IF SUCCESSFUL, IT WOULD SOUND DEATH-KNELL OF AGENCY AS A CREDIBLE, OBJECTIVE ORGANIZATION - A FACT WHICH WOULD NOT BEE ETATES WHICH, LIKE SOUTHEAEAN WERE BEING PRESSED TO SUBMIT ALL THEIR NUCLEAR FACILITIES TO IAEA SAFEGUARDS. EXPRESSING PERSONAL ADMIRATION FOR

SENEGALESE CHAIRMAN CISSE, HE STATED HIS REGRETS THAT HE SHOULD HAVE TO PRESIDE OVER QUOTE CHARADE UNQUOTE IN THIS TWENTIETH ANNIVERSARY CELEBRATION OF COMING INTO FORCE OF STATUTE OF AGENCY, WHICH SAG HAD HELPED TO SHAPE. RESERVING HIS

GOV'TS RIGHT TO APPEAL CASE TO ICJ (PURSUAN ARTICLE XVII OF STATUTE),

HE THEN PROPOSED AMENDMENT TO CHAIRMAN'S PROPOSAL WHICH WOULD REINSTATE SOUTH AFRICA IN PLACE OF EGYPT ON CHAIRMAN'S LIST AND ASKED FOR ROLL-CALL VOTE ON HIS AMENDMENT.

4. ENSUING DISCUSSION WAS ESSENTIALLY SERIES OF EXPLANATIONS OF POSITION PRIOR TO VOTE. NIGERIAN GOVERNOR LED OFF RESPONSE IN WHICH HE WAS SUPPORTED BY MOST OF GROUP OF 77 AND EE REPS (PAKISTAN, USSR, POLAND, CZECHOSLAVAKIA, LIBYA, EGYPT, YUGOSLAVIA, INDIA, MALAYSIA, INDONESIA, PHILIPPINES, BANGLADESH, PANAMA, MEXICO, NIGER, SENEGAL). MAIN POINTS OF THIS SPEAKER AND HIS SUPPORTERS WERE, OMITTING MOST FLAMBOYANT RHETORIC, (A) UNSUITABILITY OF SAG AS QUOTE INTERNATIONAL LEPER UNQUOTE TO BE REPRESENTED IN INTERNATIONAL ORGANIZATION, LET ALONE IN GOVERNING COUNCILS (B) APPEAL TO HIGHER LAW THAN STATUTE WHICH
CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 04 STATE 141569

DISQUALIFIES SAG IN NAME OF HUMANITY (C) ASSERTION THAT GEN, CONF. RESOLUTION ADOPTED AT RIO (G.C.(XX)/RES/336) CALLED FOR PUNITIVE ACTION AGAINST SOUTH AFRICA, AND TOOK PRECEDENCE OVER STATUTE, (D) CONTENTION THAT TIME HAS COME TO RECOGNIZE THAT IAEA CANNOT QUOTE ISOLATE UNQUOTE ITSELF FROM WORLD COMMUNITY, THAT TECHNICAL SUBJECT MATTER CAN NO LONGER BE DIVORCED FROM POLITICAL REALITIES. SARDONIC CONTRIBUTION TO THIS LINE OF ARGUMENT WAS PROVIDED BY EGYPTIAN REP (SIRRY) WHO SAID HE RECALLED THAT SO-CALLED OBJECTIVE CRITERIA FOR DESIGNATION WAS DEvised BY 1956 COMMITTEE, IN WHICH SOUTH AFRICA PARTICIPATED AND WHICH LED TO QUOTE PRMANENT UNQUOTE DESIGNATION OF ALL COMMITTEE MEMBERS.

5. OF THOSE SUPPORTING SOUTH AFRICA'S REDESIGNATION CANADA WAS FIRST TO JOIN BATTLE, ARGUING THAT WHETHER OR NOT SAG WAS QUOTE REPRESENTATIVE UNQUOTE OF AF REGION. DUTY OF BOARD UNDER ARTICLE VI WAS BASED SOLELY ON TECHNICAL AND OBJECTIVE CRITERIA. ANY OTHER COURSE WOULD BE DANGEROUS TO FUTURE OF AGENCY. SPEAKING ON BEHALF OF ALL EC MEMBER STATES, UK GOVERNOR (HERZIG) CONDEMNED APARTHEID BUT STATED THAT THE OBLIGATIONS OF ARTICLE VI WERE CLEAR AND COULD NOT BE RATIONALIZED AWAY. WITH DUE RESPECT TO EGYPT, THEREFORE, EC STATES WOULD SUPPORT SOUTH AFRICA. STATEMENTS FOLLOWED, ALONG SIMILAR LINES, BY REP OF AUSTRALIA, DENMARK, FRG, FRANCE, JAPAN, PORTUGAL, NETHERLANDS, U.S. AUSTRALIAN REP (FURLONGER) OBSERVED THAT REAL ISSUE BEFORE BOARD WAS NOT ACCEPTABILITY OF APARTHEID BUT THE OBJECTIVE FACTS RELEVANT TO CRITERIA FOR DESIGNATION. ATTEMPTS HAD BEEN MADE WITHOUT SUCCESS HE SAID, TO ACCOMMODATE WISHES OF AF GROUP FOR A SEPARATE

DESIGNATED SEAT. WITH FAILURE OF THESE ATTEMPTS, AUSTRALIA WOULD HAVE TO VOTE STRICTLY ON THE BASIS OF THOSE CRITERIA. FRENCH GOVERNOR (GOLDSCHMIDT), STATED THAT HE COULD NOT APPROVE A LIST WHICH OMITTED SOUTH AFRICA, A STATE WHICH WAS SUPPOSEDLY GUARDIAN OF STATUTE, SHOULD BE GUILTY OF

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 05 STATE 141569

ITS VIOLATION. U.S. GOVERNOR DELIVERED STATEMENT, DERIVED FROM MOST OF POINTS IN STATEMENT SUGGESTED REF C, STRESSING SEPARATE PUBLIC STATEMENTS U.S. HAS MADE ABHORRING POLICY OF APARTHEID AND ITS PAST AND CONTINUING EFFORTS TO CONTRIBUTE TO SOLUTION OF COMPLEX PROBLEMS IN SOUTHERN

AFRICA, BUT NOTING FURTHER THAT OBLIGATIONS OF BOARD PURSUANT ARTICLE VI OF STATUTE WERE CLEARLY BASED ON TECHNICAL CRITERIA. U.S. FELT THAT SOUTH AFRICA MET THOSE CRITERIA.

6. CONCLUSION OF DISCUSSION WAS FOLLOWED BY EXASPERATING SERIES OF POINTS OF ORDER LED BY NIGERIAN GOVERNOR, AND CONFUSION IN SECRETARI AS TO VOTING PROCEDURE. AFTER STRONG PLEA BY U.S. GOVERNOR FOR SOME MEASURE OF RESPECT FOR RULES OF PROCEDURE IT WAS AGREED THAT IN ACCORDANCE WITH RULE 44 A ROLL-CALL VOTE SHOULD BE HELD ON ON SOUTH AFRICAN AMENDMENT TO CHAIRMAN'S PROPOSAL, I.E. TO SUBSTITUTE SOUTH AFRICA FOR EGYPT AS DESIGNATED MEMBER FROM AFRICA. FOLLOWING THIS VOTE AND AT INSISTENCE OF NIGERIAN GOVERNOR, VOTE WAS THEN TAKEN ON CHAIRMAN'S ORIGINAL PROPOSAL. AT CONCLUSION OF VOTE, IT WAS AGREED THAT EGYPT HAD BEEN DESIGNATED AND THAT RECORD OF THIS VOTE WOULD CONSTITUTE REPORT CALLED FOR BY OPERATIVE PARA OF RESOLUTION OF LAST YEAR'S SESSION OF GEN. CON. CHAIRMAN THEN ADJOURNED BOARD SESSION IMMEDIATELY (LEAVING NO OPPORTUNITY FOR U.S. REP TO MAKE ALL POINTS CONTAINED IN STATEMENT TRANSMITTED REF C AS REVISED).

7. COMMENT: OUTCOME OF THIS ISSUE, CAPPING YEAR-LONG EFFORT ON PART OF IMITANT LDC'S, SURPRISED NO ONE. AS REPORTED BY MISSION LAST FALL, ACQUIESCENCE OF ENTIRE GENERAL CONFERENCE IN RESOLUTION CALLING ON BOARD TO

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 06 STATE 141569

REVIEW CONTINUED MEMBERSHIP OF SOUTH AFRICA IN AGENCY SECURED THAT

CONTINUED MEMBERSHIP FOR 1976-77 AT PRICE OF ITS EXCLUSIOON FROM
1977-78 BOARD.

ON THE OTHER HAND, IF VOTES REVEALED UNANIMITY ON PART
OF LDC'S IT ALSO REVEALED WHAT SEEMS TO US AS UNUSUAL
DEGREE OF SOLIDARITY AMONG SUPPORTERS OF INTEGRITY OF
STATUTE. VOTE SPREAD CAN HARDLY BE TERMED OVERWHELMING
VICTORY BY LDC'S. ARGENTINA AND BRAZIL, IMPORTANT LA
MEMBERS OF BOARD, WHILE VOTING WITH LDC'S, REMAINED SILENT
DURING DEBATE.

PERFORMANCE OF SENEGALESE CHAIRMAN WAS
SCRRUPULOUSLY PROFESSIONAL AND NON-PARTISAN THROUGHOUT.
EFFORTS ON HIS PART TO REACH COMPROMOSE ON THIS ISSUE,
WHILE UNSUCCESSFUL, REFLECTED HIS STATESMANSHIP. TAPE

UNQUOTE VANCE

CONFIDENTIAL

NNN

Message Attributes

Automatic Decaptioning: X
Capture Date: 01-Jan-1994 12:00:00 am
Channel Indicators: n/a
Current Classification: UNCLASSIFIED
Concepts: MEETING AGENDA
Control Number: n/a
Copy: SINGLE
Sent Date: 17-Jun-1977 12:00:00 am
Decaption Date: 01-Jan-1960 12:00:00 am
Decaption Note:
Disposition Action: RELEASED
Disposition Approved on Date:
Disposition Case Number: n/a
Disposition Comment: 25 YEAR REVIEW
Disposition Date: 22 May 2009
Disposition Event:
Disposition History: n/a
Disposition Reason:
Disposition Remarks:
Document Number: 1977STATE141569
Document Source: CORE
Document Unique ID: 00
Drafter: JPTREVITHICK
Enclosure: n/a
Executive Order: GS
Errors: N/A
Expiration:
Film Number: D770218-1073
Format: TEL
From: STATE
Handling Restrictions: n/a
Image Path:
ISecure: 1
Legacy Key: link1977/newtext/t19770643/aaaabmct.tel
Line Count: 242
Litigation Code IDs:
Litigation Codes:
Litigation History:
Locator: TEXT ON-LINE, ON MICROFILM
Message ID: 1779827a-c288-dd11-92da-001cc4696bcc
Office: ORIGIN IO
Original Classification: CONFIDENTIAL
Original Handling Restrictions: n/a
Original Previous Classification: n/a
Original Previous Handling Restrictions: n/a
Page Count: 5
Previous Channel Indicators: n/a
Previous Classification: CONFIDENTIAL
Previous Handling Restrictions: n/a
Reference: 77 STATE 138395, 77 VIENNA 4789, 77 IAEA VIENNA 7
Retention: 0
Review Action: RELEASED, APPROVED
Review Content Flags:
Review Date: 29-Nov-2004 12:00:00 am
Review Event:
Review Exemptions: n/a
Review Media Identifier:
Review Release Date: n/a
Review Release Event: n/a
Review Transfer Date:
Review Withdrawn Fields: n/a
SAS ID: 2107578
Secure: OPEN
Status: NATIVE
Subject: JUNE BOARD MEETING: AGENDA ITEM 7: DESIGNATION OF MEMBERS
TAGS: AORG, PARM, SF, IAEA
To: CAIRO DAKAR
Type: TE
vdkgvwkey: odbc://SAS/SAS.dbo.SAS_Docs/1779827a-c288-dd11-92da-001cc4696bcc
Review Markings:
Margaret P. Grafeld
Declassified/Released
US Department of State
EO Systematic Review
22 May 2009
Markings: Margaret P. Grafeld Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 22 May 2009